Consumers Or Being Consumed: A Case Study Of Additive Bilingualism Of ‘Hybrid Brushus’ In Islamabad, Pakistan

Ejaz Mirza¹, Muhammad Haseeb Nasir², Muhammad Farooq Alam³, Hajra Arshad⁴

¹Assistant Professor, NUML, Rawalpindi Email: emirza@numl.edu.pk
²Assistant Professor, NUML, Islamabad
³Assistant Professor, NUML, Rawalpindi
⁴Ph.D Scholar, NUML, Islamabad.

Abstract
This research is a case study of additive bilingualism in ‘Hybrid Brushus’ of Islamabad. The study is qualitative and unveils the impact of language hybridity on Brushuski speakers. The sample of the study is a hybrid Brushu family and a causal comparative approach is used to conduct semi-structured interviews. The findings of the study show that participants use different languages including Urdu, English, and Brushuski to communicate in different contexts. Brushuski has significant use in domestic settings whereas teens use mixed languages at college and school levels. Language is used to in-group or out-group people from discourses. The pure Brushus observe that the accent and language of Hybrid Brushus are changing but this change is not noticeable for hybrid Brushus. There is a need to preserve regional spoken languages in native lands by documentation because hybridity is consuming lesser languages and the hegemony of dominant languages is pushing regional languages to a threshold of endangerment.

Keywords: Additive bilingualism, Brushus, Language documentation, Communication

1. INTRODUCTION
Although there is no exact data available on the number of bilinguals in the world but it is estimated that 50 percent of the world population is bilingual (Fabbro, 1999; Leikin, Schwartz & Tobin, 2012). 6000 languages are spoken in the world and many countries in one way or another are bi or multilingual (Dewaele, Housen & Wei, 2003). This bilingualism has great political and social importance. In addition, bilingualism is the center of interest for various scientific
disciplines including linguistics, psycholinguistics, Neurolinguistics, and education. It is noticed that one of the most defining attributes of bilingualism is language switching which may sculpt the brain networks (Abutalebi & Green, 2007; Hernandez, 2009; Luk, Green, Abutalebi & Grady, 2012). This linguistic switching has a cognitive cost (Rogen & Monsell, 1995), and to do well one would be required to switch selective attention from trial to trial, which requires cognitive control. The switching of language varies widely from culture to culture and this habit of switching is contingent in bilingual communities, which is dependent on speaker, hearer, and mode of communication (Grosjean, 2001). The quantum of code-switching in non-dominant language may be less. Moreover, context acts as stimuli and facilitates the switching of languages.

Pakistan is a multilingual and multiethnic country and most Pakistanis are bilingual or multi-lingual (Manan, Dumanig & David, 2015). About 77 languages are spoken in the country, out of which 72 are considered indigenous languages, and the rest of 5 are immigrant languages (Ethnologue, 2015). English is the most powerful language among these languages (Rahman, 1996) and English-medium educational institutions are accessible to a tiny elite class (Mustafa, 2011; Rahman, 2004a, 2007; Rassool & Mansoor, 2007). The Federal Constitution of 1973 declared Urdu as the national and official language of Pakistan. Urdu and English are considered languages of Academia and they are used for official proceedings as well. Urdu is the national lingua franca of Pakistan and indigenous languages have practical use in indigenous speech communities. Indigenous languages are usually turned into social ghettos (Rehman, 2005) and these languages are used in intra-community domains. People of Pakistan have a tilt towards English and perceive that it has greater cultural and economic capital as compared to the indigenous language (Mehboob 2002; 2009; Manan & David, 2013; Manan, David and Dumanig, 2014; Mansoor, 1993, 2005; Rahman, 2004a).

Northern areas of Pakistan are rich in linguistic and cultural diversity. About 30 indigenous languages are spoken in this region. The northern area of Pakistan is a transit zone between the Himalayas, Central, and South Asia, which makes the heritage of this region distinct (Lilijegren & Akhunzada, 2017; Cacopardo & Cacopardo, 2001).
A total of 87,000 Burusho speakers are living in Pakistan (Lilijegren & Akhunzada, 2017). Burushaski has two varieties; Werchik war (spoken in Yasin Valley) and Burushaski (spoken in Nagar and Hunza Valley). Burushaski is the only language-isolate spoken in northern Pakistan. The neighboring groups include Kalasha and Khowar to West and Shina to South, and this group is named as Indo-Aryan Dardic group.

Table 1 Languages of Northern Pakistan listed according to Phylogenetic

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Genus</th>
<th>Subdivision</th>
<th>Subgroup</th>
<th>Language</th>
<th>ISO 639-3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indo-European</td>
<td>Indo-Aryan</td>
<td>North-western</td>
<td>Runar</td>
<td>Daneli</td>
<td>[dnl]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gawarbat</td>
<td>[gwt]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kalasha</td>
<td>[kla]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Khowar</td>
<td>[khw]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gawri (Kalami)</td>
<td>[gwc]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Indus Kohistani</td>
<td>[muy]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Torwali</td>
<td>[trw]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Chilisso</td>
<td>[chb]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gwro</td>
<td>[gwr]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bateri</td>
<td>[btr]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shina</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gilgiti Shina</td>
<td>[scl]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kohistani Shina</td>
<td>[plk]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ushojo</td>
<td>[ush]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kundal Shahi</td>
<td>[shd]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kalkoti</td>
<td>[xka]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pahula</td>
<td>[phl]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kashmiri</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kashmiri</td>
<td>[kas]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lahnda</td>
<td>Northern</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Northern Hindko</td>
<td>[hno]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pahari-Pothwari</td>
<td>[phr]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gojri</td>
<td>[gji]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Domaaki</td>
<td>[dmc]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuristani</td>
<td></td>
<td>Northern</td>
<td></td>
<td>Kaniari</td>
<td>[xvi]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kati</td>
<td>[bli]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iranian</td>
<td>Eastern</td>
<td>Northeastern</td>
<td></td>
<td>Northern Pashto</td>
<td>[pbo]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yidgha</td>
<td>[ydg]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Waltchi</td>
<td>[wdl]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Western</td>
<td>Southwestern</td>
<td></td>
<td>Dani</td>
<td>[pry]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sino-Tibetan</td>
<td>Tibet-Burman</td>
<td>Western</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bodish</td>
<td>[bof]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isolate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Burushaski</td>
<td>[bos]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Burushaki is the dominant variety of Hunza and Nagar valley and it is a cause of a rapid decrease in Domaaki speakers (Weinreich, 2011). Domaaki speakers are switching to the dominant language of Hunza and it has an adverse effect on the Dommaki variety. In contrast to the negative impact of the Burushaski language on neighbouring language varieties in Hunza Valley, other dominant languages in metropolitan cities have a negative influence on Burushaski. The current study would provide an insight into how Burushos living in metropolitan cities are being affected by other dominant languages. Brusho speakers living in metropolitan cities have become additive bilingual where they make use of additional languages for social interactions. Urdu is used for socialization with other speech communities and English is adopted for educational and
professional qualifications. The current study investigates the role of additional languages on the native language skills of Brushus.

2. STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM
For better education and job opportunities, some people from the northern area of Pakistan move to metropolitan cities and try to adjust to new speech communities. To live and survive in a new setup, people become language hybrids. There is a need to see how language hybrids are affected due to the new environment, and how linguistic plurality is affecting Burushaski speakers living in Islamabad city.

3. RESEARCH OBJECTIVES
1. To understand the impact of language hybridity on the mother tongue of Burushaski speakers
1. In what ways does the language hybridity impacts the mother tongue of Burushaski speakers?

METHODOLOGY
The present study is qualitative in approach, it is a case study where a Brusho family living in Islamabad has been interviewed. The teenagers include one girl (20 years), two boys (13-16 years old) and parents (40-45 years) are the subjects. This study is about 2 generations of Burusho speakers living in the metropolitan city. The first language of parents and children is Burushaski. Siblings and fathers have a thorough command of the Urdu language and good exposure to the English language, whereas the mother is a Burusho speaker. She is a housewife and does not have any exposure to other languages spoken in the locality. The only exposure to Urdu mother gets is when an Urdu speaker friend or distant family member comes home; her dominant language is Burusho. On the contrary, fathers and children prefer to speak Urdu and rarely English most of the time. They preferably use Urdu to converse and speak Burusho only when they have to interact with their mother, grandmother or any Burusho received as a guest. The family visits native land on vacation where they speak the Burusho language only. This is a qualitative and causal comparative study. Semi-structure dinter views were conducted to know the impact of dominant languages (Urdu, English) on Burusho speakers. Themes were identified based on interviews and the following section contains thematic analysis and findings of this study.

Result and discussion
Burushaski is the first language of the current generation although the family is living in Islamabad for the last 10 years. The family moved to different cities where the dominant language was Urdu. The data includes a conversation between the interviewer (researcher) and interviewees.
1. **Language for daily interactions:** Since Brushuski is the first language of the family they prefer to speak Brushuski at home while living in Islamabad. But when the family goes to Hunza for vacations, they do not speak Urdu and speak Brushuski. It is the culture in the native city to speak the native language and other interlocutors do not encourage the use of any other language including Urdu. Moreover, code-meshing and code-switching are not allowed by native speakers and pure Brushaski is spoken in native areas. In a response to a question about the mixing of other languages in cities like Islamabad, one of the participants added that

   We have to switch to Urdu or English because here people around us are speaking Urdu and in college, we speak English with each other and Urdu. So there is no one to understand our language. Soto make them understand, what we are saying, we have to switch from Burushaski to Urdu or English.

The main purpose of language use is communication, Brushu students mix language codes in academic settings to understand and be understood. On the contrary, in Hunza, code-switching is not appreciated. Urdu is the national lingua franca of Pakistan, especially in urban areas. English is the language of academics at the tertiary level of education. English is the medium of instruction so it is the requirement of institutes that students have to be able to get knowledge in English. To interact with the speech communities of the cities, people must have intelligibility of Urdu. So, Burusho switch from their mother tongue to languages of communication and languages used for interaction in society.

2. **Addition of language (s) for communication:** It is important to understand the transition of the family from pure Brushaski to another language (s). One of the respondents said that;

   It is not that much easy. For me and my brothers and baba(father), it was okay but for mom, it’s a little difficult.

The mother is a pure Brushu speaker and she spends most of the time at home and interacts with other Brushu families where she uses her native language for communication. Moving to Islamabad has not influenced her language as compared to her husband and kids. She barely speaks Urdu, her daughter justifies this by saying;

   Because as our mom is not that much educated, she is I think so, only middle passed (elementary education)and she faces difficulty; because she always speaks Burushaski when we were in Hunza. But in Hunza, we go to colleges and school. There we came to speak with each other in Urdu and English, so that was not difficult for us but it was difficult for mom to speak.

**Explanation:** To acquire language, the first requirement for a speaker is exposure to the language. Some theorists say bombardment of input is required to acquire language. Language learning is a conscious effort, which is done under proper guidance. The siblings are continuously learning and improving language due to the school or college environment. They are provided with continuous guidance to learn Urdu and the English language. Father is also using Urdu with people in his organization, so he is comfortable speaking Urdu or English. In the case of the
mother, she is a housewife and does not interact with people outside the home; her language remains redundant in the case of Urdu. The interviewees believe there is a link between education and language learning, but that is not the case. More than education, it is the exposure to Urdu or English language, which limits the ability of the mother to learn a second language with full expertise. In further discussion about the additive bilingual abilities of the mother, one of the children said that the family moved to Sialkot before coming to Islamabad. It was the first migration from Hunza for the family; the mother faced real difficulty in adopting Urdu as a new language for communication.

No, when we were the first time in Sialkot, mom started to interact with family friends whom baba knows and she faced difficulty in singular plural words in Urdu, in feminine and masculine, she disturbs those things. Yes, she can understand, but cannot make differences in singular and plural, we always tell her it is not like that.

**Explanation:** Burushaski is a gender-neutral language like Pashto. In Urdu, every object has a gender. Anyone including English speakers, when they start the Urdu language, the issue of learning genders of non-human objects is very difficult. Housewife faces the same difficulty.

3. **Impact of Additive Bilingualism on Brushuski speakers**

As a researcher, I was intrigued to question the impact of additional languages on the mother tongue of Brushus.

Yes, we are getting away from our language because here when we speak with others in our home as well, we use mostly Urdu words and we mostly switch to Urdu while speaking Burushaski...when we go to Hunza, there also when we are talking to our grandmother, our uncle or our relatives; we mostly switch to Urdu in between. So, they are saying, like they are living in cities, they are forgetting their language and this much.

Language is an amalgamation of utterances, sounds, and intonations. Participants shared that we cannot feel how our language has changed after moving to Islamabad but when they go back to their native areas where pure Brushus are living, they can observe the change in the language of these migrant families. The adoption of intonation patterns is a natural phenomenon and Brushus living in Islamabad are adopting it unintentionally. In another question about the transfer of Brushu language to the next generation, one of the respondents said that;

No ma’am, because we are making so much mixture of Urdu and English words in our Burushaskiat this age, so I don't think that when we will be having our family, we will make them learn to speak pure Burushaski.

**Explanation:** Code-switching and code-mixing are very common with bilinguals. Some researchers call it crutch-syndrome wherein the absence of some word from L1 people use a second language as a crutch to take support. The same phenomenon exists with Burusho in that they keep switching codes for communication more coherent. In the influence of other languages, the purity of Burushski is affected.
4. **Balance in different languages**

In the case of additive bilingualism, it is very important to understand the role of different languages in a different contexts. In a question about how the Brushes decide which language to use in any context, the respondent said that;

> Sometimes it happens that when I have to talk with baba about my, I need something and mom is saying, no no, it's ok, don't bring this to her, to convince my father. She understands but she cannot that much understand as when we speak in Burushaski, that's why.

Indirectly she meant that she uses Urdu to out-group her mother from the conversation. Other siblings also shared that they use languages trickily to be understood by their father and siblings. Since the mother is observing the discussions and wants to be part of them, children shared that nowadays mom does the same.

The mixing and use of different language patterns vary in people of different ages. Since the father is elder and has to communicate with wife as well children so the use of different languages. Kids shared that; sometimes he speaks pure Burushaski but mostly he also mixes.

5. **Pronunciation issues in learning Brushuski**

Wherever two or more than two language speakers coexist, they try to understand other languages for communication and it helps in making new speech communities. The researcher wanted to know whether non-Brushus teenagers in college and schools show interest in learning Brushaski.

> It’s very difficult. My friends, when they came to know that I am from Hunza, they tried to learn some words from me, but they make it so meaningless when they speak, they don't speak the way I speak. So it becomes difficult to tell them that, no it’s not this, because there is much difference in pronunciation.

Like if I say, when yesterday, my friend was asking me what you call for ‘bread’ in Burushaski? I said we say it ‘shaapeek’ and she was like ‘speak’ ‘speak’... {Laughter}, it becomes funny.

**Explanation:** This is a common phenomenon that when speakers try to learn a foreign or second language after a critical age, they have issues in producing native-like utterances. It is the case here. Residents of Islamabad, coming from different areas of Pakistan, have different mother tongues. The classmates of the interviewee are girls belonging to the age of 18-24 years, they have already been equipped to utter sounds in a particular way, so they find it difficult to pronounce Burushaski words.

Transfer of language characteristics is active for Brushuski speakers as well. When Brushus interact with non-Brushu speakers, their language is also influenced by other languages like Urdu and English. Participants were asked whether they feel that their native language utterances are changed, they said;
Yes, if my grandparents come here, and I speak to them, their pronunciation is much different from ours.
They say, and then they have bit conflicts like they (children of Burusho living in the city) are forgetting their language and they are becoming modern so, they should focus on their language.
They added that
Yes, ma’am, we can’t feel it. I don't know why it changes. We speak like that but they predict (perceive) differently. But we can’t feel it.

**Explanation:** This is a very interesting phenomenon. The idiolect is an individuals’ way of using language. The interviewee herself is not aware of what phonemic level changes are occurring to her language. Unlike code-switching which is overt, pronunciation changes are unintentional and not felt by the individuals. It is the hearer, the native speaker in this case, who feels the change in the pronunciation of a native speaker living in the metropolitan city.

6. **Writing Brushuski for texting**
Like most of the regional languages of Pakistan, Burushaski is a spoken language. The alphabets are available but mostly Brushuski is writing in Roman English. When respondents were questioned about how they write in Burushuski if they have to write, the response was:

Mostly, we write it using English letters, but in Urdu.
I think this modern generation doesn’t use those letters. But maybe our grandfathers or grandmothers may be used those.

This shows the influence of other languages on Brushaski. In this age of social media where everyone has individual views and abundant use of language for texting, the researcher was curious to know about the use of Brushuski for writing texts. Interviewees (except mother) said that;

We use English letters to write in Burushaski
Sometimes we text in Burushaski because of the spell we don't get, words which are difficult for us to do in Burushaski, we write in Urdu or English.
The above responses are a good example of trans languaging where different languages are used for communicating. This might influence the purity of different languages but at the same time makes communication more effective and more understandable. The interactional role of languages is an example of ‘symbiosis’.

7. **In-grouping and Out-grouping**
Another interesting use of language shared by the participants was in-grouping and out-grouping people from the discourses. The respondents said;

We use mixed language. English sometimes, sometimes Urdu or Burushaski. If we are going to have something very personal discussion, we use that language that others do not understand. Like if I am here with my friends, and I am going to text
someone like my cousin or relatives about something personal then I will text in Burushaski so that my friends do not understand here.

**Explanation**: Burushaski is a spoken language and except few examples where Latin script was used to document details of the Burusho language, the use of the written script is not a common phenomenon. So the people who use it in writing, especially the interviewee and her circle, prefer to use roman Burushaski script in written communication. This phenomenon is similar in teens and fathers of these teens. Another important aspect mentioned here is the use of language for in-grouping and out-grouping some individuals. Heema shared that when she wants to out-group her friends or her mother, she uses a language that is unintelligible for them. Content of the messages is context-specific and the youngsters more frequently adopt this in and out-grouping phenomenon. At times this technique is used by the youngsters to out-group mother as she does not understand Urdu or English.

8. **Significance of Brushuski for Brushus**

Participants of the research shared that they love their language. They like Urdu as a language of communication but Brushaski has a special place in the life of Brushu people. In a question about the significance of Brushuski language, a respondent said that;

Mostly, I switch to music in our own language. Because I think so the music which we are having in our own language, there is no substitute for that in Urdu and English.

Another family member said that

Yes, almost. But whenever I am remembering my own valley and my friends, I switch to Burushaski language music.

**Explanation**: Although this Brushu family, living in Islamabad, is using Urdu and English for communication with other speech communities, Brushaski is their first choice for pleasure i.e. Music. Native language has a special place in the hearts of these natives. Emotional bonding and cultural understanding in Brushaski are more significant as compared to the understanding of emotion in other languages. This is evident from the words shared by one of the participants;

In Burushaski, because I personally think that while expressing our feelings in our own language is much better than expressing in another language.

Because the words in Burushaski affect from inside. (Big laughter)

9. **Consuming language (s)**

In the case of additive bilingualism, speakers start consuming words from the additional language. This is not intentional for the speakers but they do so unintentionally. A participant said that;

Like my grandmother, she always uses pure Burushaski, but she uses the word ‘washroom’ or ‘bathroom’. We use the word ‘khat’ for a letter as it is used in Urdu.

**Explanation**: Love for mother tongue is something very common in high culture societies. Language is one of the most essential components of the biodiversity of any environment. People
like their language. Moreover, the emotional states are the psychological states where people use their first language to share emotion, to express anger, to abuse, and to communicate their feeling. It is the case here. Although the participant of the research claims to love her language, still she is switching to another language and admits that she might not be able to pass the pure L1 to her next generation.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSION

a) Additive bilingualism as a need
People move to cities for better education and better work opportunities. To accommodate in new settings, they have to learn new languages. Learning a new language helps people to adjust and communicate with speech communities in new settings. In this way, additive bilingualism is playing a positive role.

b) Code-switching and code-mixing
Code-switching is a very common issue among immigrants. If code-switching is used only to make communication coherent, it is beneficial. But if it starts consuming the L1, it has a negative role. It is happening with Burusho speakers, it is hurting our current generation. The abundant use of code-switching is consuming the Burushaski language in metropolitan cities. As mentioned in the introduction of this research, in Hunza Valley Burushaski is consuming Domaaki and some other varieties of that area but in the current study, it can be seen that Urdu is consuming Burushaski itself mostly and English to some extent. If steps are not taken to revitalize the language, there are chances that Burushuski will reduce speakers of the language and might be added to endangered languages.

c) Use of language to in-grouping
This is interesting and common in other bilinguals as well, the language is used in group or out group people from the conversation. Language as a tool has paradoxical uses. On one hand, it is used to communicate emotions, a tool to interact, and on the other hand to distance people.

d) Language vitality and the attitude of natives
The role and attitude of the native speakers of any language have a direct relationship with the vitality (healthiness) of any language. Language is a part of the biodiversity of climate and culture. If native speakers have a positive attitude towards their native language, they can preserve, revitalize and prevent language from endangerment. The loss of any native language is loss of heritage as most of the information about flora and fauna, norms and values, culture are passed through intergenerational communication. Lack of language documentation, taking indigenous languages for granted and avoiding any measures to preserve local languages has a devastating impact on languages and speakers of those languages.

Finally, it is important to care for indigenous languages, purify them, document them, own them, and to maintain them for the sustainability of biodiversity. Modernizing language and
technology integration are healthy but not at the cost of the vitality of indigenous language. Additive bilingualism is good if it is used wisely.

REFERENCES

Language Policy (Online first) 1–24. doi:10.1007/s10993-014-9343-x.