The Analysis of Benchmarking Use to Improve the Quality of Competitive Advance among Journal Houses in State Islamic Religious Collage

Nazarudin

Rr. Rina Antasari

Padjrin
Email: nazarudin_uin@radenfatah.ac.id

Received December 09, 2020; Accepted February 20, 2021
ISSN: 1735-188X
DOI: 10.14704/WEB/V18I1/WEB18079

Abstract

This research is aimed to discover management system, classify the differences and similarities of Journal Houses, and figure out other factor beyond the management elements that support the achievement purpose of improving the competitive quality among Journal Houses in accordance with journal accreditation standards. This research used qualitative method. The data source were obtained from Journal Houses of UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, UIN Walisongo Semarang, IAIN Kudus dan IAIN Salatiga. The data was collected through in-depth interviews and documentation studies. The data obtained were analyzed in descriptive qualitative. This research concludes that the Journal Houses management of UIN and IAIN benchmarked do not have similar systems. Each Journal House runs according to its own way. There is no adaptive Journal House management format that can be emulated directly from UIN and IAIN Journal House benchmarked by Journal House of UIN Raden Fatah Palembang. The alternative is to collaborate on how to manage the Journal Houses of each benchmarking target in order to be a new applicable system.

Keywords
Journal Houses, Competitive Advance, Benchmarking.

Introduction

The phenomenon of open access has been existed since the internet usage has developed in the world, in spite of that the term of open access has been published formally and
popularized in the event of Budapest open access initiative in 2002. Open access is officially defined as literature or digital reference source, online, free cost, and free from copyright and license (Hua, Sun, Walsh, Worthington, & Glenny, 2016; Laakso & Björk, 2016; Prasetyawan, 2017). In Indonesia, it has been begun since 2000 and more developed in 2005 by the sign of easy internet access (Liauw, 2013; Mohd Fadzil, Zakaria, & Mohd Kiram, 2018). Its development is supported by collages to provide research results of researchers, lecturers, and collage students.

The results of lecturers' research by collages are disseminated in the form of books, journals, proceedings, and other forms. Those are available on internet and can be accessed by anyone, anywhere, anytime openly with internet access only and the data access is free. It shows that open access development in Indonesia is prodigious and most prominent is the social awareness to share with world community.

The collages in Indonesia use repository and journal platform. Repository application such as e-prints, Dspace, SliMS (Senayan Library Management System), Setiadi (Senayan System of Electronic Thesis and dissertation), and etc. While the open journal system (OJS) platform is mostly used in Indonesia for journal publishing.

The repository Eprints software 79% and Dspace 13% are institutional repository software that highly used, compared to SliMS Senayan, GAE and Ispektra repository software are the least number used by several universities in Indonesia. Likewise, there is 1% repository software that developed by the collage users itself (unknown specifications) (Arnomo, 2016, 2018; Bankier & Gleason, 2014). It can be seen on the chart below for further information.

**Chart 1 Institutional repository software used by collages in Indonesia (Arnomo, 2018)**

Currently, Open journal system (OJS) is a platform that mostly used in Indonesia for journal publishing. OJS was first acquainted in 2002 as a platform of journal publishing and management electronically. This platform is developed by Public Knowledge Project (PKP) from Simon Fraser University and licensed by GNU General Public License.
Indonesia has 12,800 journals until 2012 (Lukman, Marlina, Keumalasari, Akbar, & Riyanto, 2012). This amount is more increased year by year due to the need of collage related to dissemination of research results in the form of journals.

Islamic Religious Collage (PTKI) is one of the higher education institution under the Ministry of Religion which uses *Open Journal System platform* for journal publishing. Before acquainted with OJS, the collages below still managed the journals in print and manually. UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta with Studia Islamika and UIN Sunan Kalijaga with Al-Jamiah who initiated their journal management through OJS and becomes “Qibla” especially for journal administrator of Islamic Religious Collage (PTKI).

Minister of religion of republic of indonesia through Directorate of Islamic Higher Education (Diktis) conducted a training and donation distribution to switch from print to electronic version using OJS. Moreover, Directorate of Islamic Higher Education (Diktis) released an instruction that journal must be *open journal system* (OJS) and registered in Moraref (*Ministry of Religious Reference*) Portal in page of moraref.kemenag.go.id (Wildan, 2017).

Directorate of Islamic Higher Education (Diktis) through kasi scientific publications Dr. Subandriyah, M.Pd. in about 2015 initiated the first Journal House establishment in STAIN Kudus by the name STAIN Kudus Journal House then followed by UIN Raden Fatah Palembang, UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, dan UIN Ar-Raniri Aceh. Journal House has become main discussion by journal administrator as a model to evoke the spirit of journal management. The idea of a Journal House is inseparable from the need to develop journals in campus environment. Its existence is progressively needed to accelerate and support journals development until now in 2019. Therefore, the journal development in campus environment of state Islamic Religious State Collage (PTKIN) is prominent for sustainable process.

Journal House implemented a *roadmap* with policies based on each collage. Certainly, the existence of Journal House is adequately encouraging development in the world Journal and academic development in Islamic Religious Collage (PTKI) environment, thereto, the journal House reached 27 Journal Houses in 2018. It is very significant development that the Journal Houses established are almost in all regions of indonesia in 2018 which is positive phenomenon. Institutionally, the Journal House existence is still very new and needs to be reinforced in various fields. The development in various fields is an effort to enhance the quality of journal articles, journal institution and the journal house competitiveness quality are international standard.
The facts show that the result of national accreditation and electronic accreditation can be said to have been very good in Islamic Religious Collage (PTKI). In total, there are 65 accredited journals print version in 2017 (Penelitian, 2017), there are 305 journals in 2018, and increased to be 151% or 463 accredited journals in 2019 (Suwendi, 2020). The success can not be separated from the journal house support, so the journals in Islamic Religious State Collage (PTKIN) run with the system agreed by the Journal House administrator.

Generally, journal management faces many problems which become really concerned. The problems concern on orientation, planning, organizing, program implementation, evaluation and the type of development program. Consequently, a specific management field is needed to manage the journal for competitive advance quality.

The Journal House of UIN Raden Fatah Palembang which incidentally was born in the early period has not shown an encouraging contribution. The existence of Journal House in UIN Raden Fatah is like “meaningless existence”. The contribution to the advancement/development of journal in environment of UIN Raden Fatah Palembang is considered zero or at least weak, moreover there was an issue to dissolve the Journal House. One indicator of weak contribution is journal accreditation, which there is no accredited journal in (Sinta 6-1) from UIN Raden Fatah environment until May 2018. The Journal House organizational structure of UIN Raden Fatah is complete (leader, secretary, the experts staff). The fund is available on Research Institute and Community Service (10% from state university operational assistance fund research). The infrastructure is very adequate however it has been said previously that it is weak contribution or even considered as “meaningless existence”. Learning from the beginning feels naive and spends a lot of time. Having internship in advance journal house is impossible due to there are many staffs and wasted funds. The most logical choice is to do benchmarking. Using benchmarking is possible for an organization/institution to obtain new view towards standard practices, identifying supremacy goals, and becoming as media to do improvement and new innovation (Arcaro, 2005).

The term of benchmarking is mostly used in the business world. Roger Milliken dubbed benchmarking as “stealing shamelessly” the meaning is taking something without any permission and not feeling ashamed. Instead of his definition was denied by Edward Deming, said however that benchmarking is not just plagiarizing method from other company (Watson, 1996). The utterance from Deming was reinforced by Fred Bowers who defined Benchmarking is as learning process for organization, which imitates the human learning process. Another notion says that benchmarking is imitation with
modification (Watson, 1996). It means that benchmarking can be formulated as an activity of *imitation with modification*, where the *modification* term has contained the meaning of *improvement* (Yuniarsih & Suwatno, 2011). The simple language of *benchmarking* is an effort to observe, imitate the observed and modify or popular as A,T,M (observe, imitate, modify).

This research is aimed to discover management system, classify the differences and similarities of journal houses, and figure out other factor beyond the management elements that support the achievement purpose of improving the competitive quality among journal houses in accordance with journal accreditation standards. In consequence, this research is expected to be recommended and applied in the Journal House of UIN Raden Fatah Palembang.

**Research Method**

This research is a field research with a qualitative approach. It is called field research because the purpose of this benchmarking is to describe empirical reality according to the phenomenon in detail and completely, as well as to describe phenomena in holistically contextual way through collecting data from a natural background by utilizing researchers as the key instruments. Data was taken at the Journal House of UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, UIN Walisongo Semarang, IAIN Kudus and IAIN Salatiga.

The key informants in this study were the head and secretary of the Journal Houses. Furthermore, in an effort to compare and re-check information, a number of supporting informants were taken from Journal House staff and journal administrator who have experience of managing journals from 6 to 12 months. The informants were chosen based on their competence and ability also activities in supporting the activities in the Journal House, mainly by using a benchmarking approach. Supporting informants were obtained by snowball according to references submitted by the Head of Journal House. With this technique, in addition to administrator or the possibility of other stakeholders who is concerned in improving the quality of the Journal House. Data was collected through in-depth interviews and documentation studies on institutional, financial, organizational structure, OJS utilization, organizational management and publications in the Journal House. The data obtained were analyzed in qualitative descriptive.
Research Results and Discussion

Research Results

To perceive the real picture of organizational management such as to what extent the elements of organizational management function themselves. Hasibuan conveyed that there six elements of management: men and women, materials, machines, methods, money dan markets (Malayu, 2001). Therefore, the benchmarking data which collected through interviews and documentations in the Journal Houses of UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, UIN Walisongo Semarang, IAIN Kudus and IAIN Salatiga referring to the intended main resource, the results are below:

1. Journal House of UIN Sunan Kakijaga Yogyakarta

First, men and woman aspect, The Journal House of UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta has the complete resource. Based on the documentation written in profile book, organizational structure includes a leader, secretary, and two staffs. Uniquely, none of the journal house administrator from leader, secretary, and staff come from Research Institute and Community Service (LP2M).

Second, materials aspect. The Journal House has a lot of articles (scientific papers) of lecturers from internal UIN Sunan Kalijaga but also from other parties. Third, machines aspect. The Journal House has computer, printer, Scanner, and other facilities included a plagiarism checker.

Fourth, method aspect. In case of method, the Journal House of UIN Sunan Kalijaga has run smoothly. head, secretary and staffs work based on the main duty and each function, does not show “overlapping works”. effectiveness and efficiency are caused by the availability of SOP (Standard Operational Procedure) and roadmap Journal House.

Nevertheless, it is good method however the men and women who carried it out do not comprehend and have no experience so that will produce unsatisfied result. Therefore, the main role in management is the human itself men and women. Money is not everything but everything will not work well without money.

Fifth, money aspect. Money aspect is one the primary source that can not be neglected. Money is medium of exchange and measuring device. The standard result of activity can be measured by money circulation in company. The Journal House of UIN Sunan Kalijaga does not have any problem in money aspect. The Journal house of UIN Sunan
Kalijaga has permanent source of fund in journal environment. Operational funds of Journal House and faculty/major journal are not saved in Research Institute and Community Service (LP2M) due to they have other source of funds that is not funded by Research Institute and Community Service (LP2M).

Sixth, *market* aspect. Market is a place to promote their products. The Journal House *market* of UIN Sunan Kalijaga are lecturers, researchers, which also from Islamic Religious State Collage (PTKI) in Java island, outside of Java island, and abroad. The lecturers/researchers are interested to publish their journal in UIN Sunan Kalijaga environment which is evidenced by the articles in queue, UIN Sunan Kaligaja has 60 journals on september. Those 60 journals are divided into 42 journals accredited in the Sinta, 1 accredited in the Sinta 1, 12 accredited in the Sinta 2, 10 accredited in the Sinta 3, 10 accredited in the Sinta 4, 9 accredited in the Sinta 5, whereas 18 journals are new journals and do not meet the requirements for accreditation.

2. Journal House of UIN WaliSongo Semarang

First, *men and women* aspect. The Journal House of UIN WaliSongo semarang does not have complete resources. According to helmi suyanto, the Journal House administrator of UIN WaliSongo has only 1 staff who is responsible directly to the head of Research and Publishing Center (Ka.Puslitpen). In spite of one journal administrator, all journals including online accreditation can be organized properly and exhaustively. The journal administrator is a volunteer due to the employment status is not public service agency (BLU) or contract worker.

Second, *materials* aspect. The Journal House of UIN WaliSongo has many articles (scientific papers from lecturers) which is not only from internal UIN WaliSongo but also from other parties. Third, *machine* aspect. The Journal House has computer, *printer, Scanner* and other facility including plagiarism checker. The completeness of *machine* aspect provides facility and creates work efficiency.

Fourth, *method* aspect. In case of *method*, the Journal House of UIN WaliSongo has run smoothly. The head of research and publishing center and staf work in accordance with the main duty and each function, do not show “overlapping” work. Effectiveness and efficiency are also supported by other facility like SOP (*Standard Operational Procedure*) and the Journal House *roadmap.*
Fifth, money, the Journal House of UIN Walisongo acquires 10% research funds in Ministry/Agency Work Plan and Budget (RKAL) research institute and Community Service (LP2M), it is used to conduct activities of quality improvement both for journal administrator or the journal itself whilst the printed journal budget is (twice in a year) funded by each faculty.

Sixth, market aspect, the Journal House of UIN Walisongo semarang has 45 journals itself until september 2019. those 45 journals, there are 33 journals accredited in the Sinta which 8 journals accredited in the Sinta 2, 8 journals accredited in the Sinta 3, 4 journals accredited in the Sinta 4, and 13 journals in the Sinta 5. The rest of 12 journals are new journals and do not meet the requirement for accreditation.

3. Journal House of IAIN Kudus

First, men and women aspect. The Journal House of IAIN kudus has complete resources. Based on the organizational structure of Journal House administrator of IAIN kudus comprises a chief (head of Research and Publishing Center), secretary (head of Subsection Administration of Research Institute and Community Service) and staff (freelance honorary/journal volunteer) who responsible directly to head of Research Institute and Community Service (LP2M). All journals matter such as OJS, input Digital Object Identifier (DOI) to Crossref and journal index to DOAJ for journal administrator and electronic accreditation consulting service are handle by one staff itself.

Second, materials aspect. The Journal House of IAIN Kudus has many articles (scientific papers) from lecturers that mostly comes from outside of IAIN Kudus. Third, method aspect. IAIN Kudus has worked well without technical instructions, SOP (Standard Operational Procedure) and etc. The Journal House of IAIN Kudus has been running as it supposed to be. Fourth, machines aspect. The Journal House of IAIN Kudus has facilities like a computer, printer, Scanner, and plagiarism checker. The impact of completeness of machines aspect provides facility and creates work efficiency. Fifth, market aspect. IAIN Kudus has permanent market. The journals in IAIN Kudus are in demand by the lecturers/researchers from domestic or abroad. Until September 2019, IAIN Kudus has 36 journals, the management is organized by Journal House. 36 journals are divided into three clusters 1) there is one reputable international journal, 2) there are 16 national accredited journal; and 3) there are 19 journals which are not national accredited.
4. Journal House of IAIN Salatiga

First, *men and women* aspect, the Journal House of IAIN Salatiga is only managed by two people, namely head is held by Research Institute and Community Service (LP2M) and secretary is held by head of Research and Publishing Center (Ka.Puslitpen). all journals matters such as OJS, input DOI/Crossref and journal index to DOAJ for journal administrator and electronic accreditation consulting service including budget matter are only done by these two people. In their busy work as head and secretary of Research Institute and Community Service (LP2M), these two people are responsible for technical journal issues such as socialization, technical assistance or guidance to acquire accreditation. Second, *materials* aspect. The Journal House of IAIN Salatiga has many articles that come from inside and outside of IAIN Salatiga. Third, *machine* aspect. The Journal House is facilitated with computer, *printer, Scanner*, plagiarism checker, and other complete facilities. The completeness of *machine* aspect has provided convenience and created work efficiency.

Fourth, *method* aspect. Method is procedures to expedite the work of Journal House. The method comprises procedures or work system that has built in the Journal House of IAIN Salatiga including time management, funds and business activities. In this method, IAIN Salatiga has run smoothly. The head of Journal House is held by the head of Research Institute and Community Service (LP2M) and secretary is held by the head of Research and Publishing Center (Ka.Puslitpen) work effective and efficient even though there is no explicit classification duty either in SOP (*Standard Operational Procedure*) or roadmap of Journal House.

Fifth, *money* aspect. For this aspect, the Journal House of IAIN Salatiga is the same as existing Journal Houses that get 10% from research fund in Ministry/Agency Work Plan and Budget (RKAL) of Research Institute and Community Service (LP2M), everything is used to conduct activities of quality improvement both for journal administrator or the journal itself. Whilst the budget of printed journal (twice in a year) is funded by each faculties.

Sixth, *market* aspect. *Market* is a place for organization to spread (promote) the products. The Journal House *market* of IAIN Salatiga is for all lecturers/researchers/writer both from Indonesia or abroad. It can be seen from the number of articles available at IAIN Salatiga journals. IAIN Salatiga has 14 Journals which divided into three classifications namely 1 journal index scopus, 10 national accredited journals, and 3 journal are not national accredited.
Research Discussion

Referring to six elements of managements above, it can be proposed that Journal House management of UIN Raden Fatah is relatively equal to the Journal Houses management of UIN and IAIN benchmarked. Viewed from men and women, the Journal House of UIN Raden Fatah has resources needed even if compared to the Journal Houses staff of UIN Walisongo, UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, IAIN Kudus whose employment status is not clear, the Journal House staff of UIN Raden Fatah has appointed as Public Service Agency (BLU). Viewed from organizational structure, the Journal House of UIN Raden Fatah is complete, head, secretary, and staff except UIN Walisongo that has a head and staff whereas IAIN Salatiga merely has a head and secretary from Research Institute and Community Service (LP2M) functionary.

Relating to men and women (human resources) above, there is something odd of commitment and spirit aspect to build accredited journal in UIN and IAIN environment. Human resources in UIN Walisongo Semarang and IAIN Salatiga whose employment status merely as “Journal Volunteer” (permanent lecturer non civil servant, not contract worker or Public Service Agency) however their spirit and commitment to raise the journal is very appreciative. Regional culture and organizational culture are predicted as one of variable to build their journal administrator character.

The research finding from Gordon, Creemers, and Reynolds presented that the strong organizational culture encourages the member to be more satisfied, motivated, and has great commitment to organization (Mutohar, 2013). Similarly, Sergiovanni found that the strong culture will enhance the commitment, enthusiastic, and member’s loyalty to organization (Mutohar, 2013). A strong culture will give birth to high morale and high morale is a manifestation of a pleasant work atmosphere, so as to encourage maximum staff participation in increasing productivity and effectiveness of managing a journal home.

From the aspect of money (source of funds), Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Fatah Palembang has similarities with State Islamic University and State Islamic Religion Institute which are signed, both are entrusted in LP2M except Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University which is not entrusted in LP2M because Journal House of Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University has a permanent source of funds from the journal environment itself. The Journal House of Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Fatah Palembang does not have a reward for journals that have achieved accreditation ranking 1 (Sinta 1), 2 (Sinta 2), and 3 (Sinta 3) as happened in Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic
University of Yogyakarta and Walisongo State Islamic University of Semarang. Seen from the way of working (methods) and machines (tools and materials that support work effectiveness) all journal houses are relatively the same. This thing that is not yet owned by the Journal House of Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Fatah Palembang is the market. The Journal House of Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Fatah Palembang has not become the target of lecturers or researchers from outside Raden Fatah State Islamic University because the journals in the Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Fatah Palembang environment are still dominated by internal writers from the Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Fatah Palembang environment itself. Then the citations of the journals in the Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Fatah Palembang environment are not yet equal to those of other campuses.

Conclusions

The Journal Houses management in UIN and IAIN benchmarked do not have the similar systems. Each Journal House runs according to its own way. There are Journal Houses that have complete and incomplete (simple) organizational structure. The Journal House administrators come from internal and external of Research Institute and Community Service (LP2M). The employment status of Journal House administrators (Staff) are varies greatly. The different things are spirit and commitment that caused by the unclear institutional status of its Journal Houses.

Based on the sixth elements of management resources (men and women, materials, machines, methods, money dan markets), House management of UIN Raden Fatah is relatively equal to the management Journal Houses of UIN and IAIN benchmarked. Market aspect, the Journal House of UIN Raden Fatah Palembang does not have permanent customers from outer. In other words, the journal market is dominated by the lecturers/researchers from UIN Raden Fatah. Likewise, citation aspect, the journal in UIN Raden Fatah is at minimum from UIN and IAIN benchmarked.

Additionally, there is no adaptive Journal House management format that can be copied directly from Journal houses of UIN and IAIN benchmarked by Journal House of UIN Raden Fatah. The alternative is to collaborate on how to manage the journal houses of each benchmarking target in order to be a new applicable system.

References

Repository. SAINTEK Journal, 13(2), 70–76.